Review Article

Artificial Intelligence in Governance: A Comprehensive Analysis of Ai Integration and Policy Development in The German Government

Oliver Bodemer*

Experienced Java and Blockchain Architect, Germany

*Corresponding Author
Oliver Bodemer, Experienced Java and Blockchain Architect, Germany

Submitted: 2024, Jan 15; **Accepted:** 2024, Feb 19; **Published:** 2024, Feb 21

Abstract

In the intricate tapestry of modern governance, the role of technology, particularly Artificial Intelligence (AI), has become increasingly pivotal. Germany, renowned for its bureaucratic efficiency and technological innovation, stands at the crossroads of a significant transformation. This paper delves into the heart of this evolution, exploring how AI is being integrated into the German government's operations. At present, Germany's bureaucratic system, known for its precision and thoroughness, faces the universal challenges of modern governance: increasing complexity, demand for faster service delivery, and the need for cost-effective administration. In this context, AI emerges as a beacon of potential, promising to enhance efficiency, reduce bureaucratic bottlenecks, and enable more informed decision-making through data-driven insights. The investigation reveals that while Germany has made strides in digitizing its public services, the full integration of AI is still in its nascent stages. The potential benefits are manifold: from automated tax processing systems that promise greater accuracy and speed, to AI-driven public safety measures that can predict and prevent incidents before they occur.

These advancements not only aim to streamline administrative processes but also enhance the citizen-government interface, making it more responsive and user-friendly. However, the journey is not without its challenges. Issues of data privacy, ethical considerations in AI deployment, and the need for robust regulatory frameworks are at the forefront of this technological shift. The study, through its methodical examination of two case studies, seeks to provide a comprehensive understanding of how AI can be harmoniously woven into the fabric of German governance, ensuring efficiency and innovation while upholding the values of transparency and accountability. In conclusion, the paper presents a detailed narrative of Germany's current bureaucratic landscape and the transformative role AI could play, offering insights and recommendations for policymakers, technologists, and administrators alike. As Germany stands on the brink of this digital revolution, the lessons gleaned from this inquiry could well chart the course for a new era of governance.

Keywords: Artificial Intelligence, German Government, Bureaucratic Efficiency, Technological Innovation, Digital Transformation, Public Services, Data Privacy, Ethical Considerations, Regulatory Frameworks, Policy Making, Governance.

Introduction

The Enigma of AI in Governance

Artificial Intelligence (AI) in governance represents a paradigm shift in how public administration can be conducted in the 21st century. The integration of AI into government operations has the potential to revolutionize service delivery, policy making, and citizen engagement. In Germany, this integration is particularly significant given the country's strong bureaucratic traditions and its leadership in technological innovation [8].

Purpose of the Study

This study aims to explore the integration of AI in the German government, examining its impact on bureaucratic efficiency and public service delivery. It seeks to understand the challenges and opportunities presented by AI in governance, and how these are navigated within the German context [21].

Research Questions

How is AI being integrated into different sectors of German governance?
What are the common challenges and opportunities presented by

AI in these sectors?

Actual Research
Recent research in the field of AI in governance highlights the dynamic challenges and opportunities faced by public administration in the era of digital transformation. Wirtz et al. (2020) developed an integrated AI governance framework for public administration, emphasizing the need for comprehensive regulatory processes to manage AI's challenges and applications [21]. Similarly, Criado and Zárate-Alcarazo (2022) explored the technological frames of Chief Information Officers in public administration, revealing a focus on AI's technological aspects while often overlooking social, political, and ethical challenges [6].

These studies underscore the complexity of integrating AI into governance and the importance of a balanced approach that considers both technological and societal implications.

Differentiation from Other Research
This research differentiates itself from existing studies by focusing specifically on the German context of AI integration in public administration. While Wirtz et al. (2020) developed an integrated AI governance framework for public administration, their study provides a broad overview without delving into the unique challenges and opportunities in the German setting [21]. Criado and Zárate-Alcarazo (2022) explored the technological frames of CIOs in public administration, but their study is centered on Spanish local governments, offering limited insights into the German scenario [6]. This research aims to fill this gap by providing a detailed analysis of AI's role in German public administration, considering the country's specific bureaucratic culture, regulatory environment, and technological landscape.

Literature Review
Trails of the Past
The historical perspective of AI in public administration reveals a journey marked by evolving technologies and shifting policy landscapes. Criado and Zárate-Alcarazo (2022) provide a socio-cognitive study on the technological frames of CIOs in Spanish local governments, offering insights into the early stages of AI integration in public administration [6]. Similarly, Kamolov et al. discuss AI as a strategic instrument in Russia, highlighting the gradual development and challenges in implementing AI within government regulation [14].

The German Context
In the German context, AI's role in public administration is shaped by the country's unique bureaucratic culture and technological landscape. Djeffal's work on normative guidelines for AI in German government and public administration provides an in-depth look at the integration of AI in Germany, considering the ethical, legal, and strategic dimensions [8]. Key points from Djeffal's chapter include:
• AI's evolving role and the importance of guidelines in shaping its integration in public administration.
• The design challenges faced by government and administration in implementing AI, emphasizing the human role in shaping AI development.
• The multifaceted roles of government and administration as users, supporters, and regulators of AI.
• The definition and aims of AI in the context of public administration, tracing its origins and goals.

The Detective's Toolkit
In the pursuit of understanding the integration of Artificial Intelligence in the German government, the research methodology adopted mirrors the eclectic and thorough toolkit of a seasoned detective. This toolkit comprises various investigative tools and techniques, each selected for their precision and relevance to the task at hand. The primary instrument in this toolkit is a comprehensive literature review, akin to a detective's magnifying glass, allowing for a detailed examination of existing research and theories [16]. This review lays the groundwork for understanding the current landscape of AI in governance.

Next, akin to a detective's fingerprint powder, data collection methods are employed to uncover hidden patterns and insights. These include surveys, interviews, and case study analyses, providing both quantitative and qualitative data [18].

Data analysis techniques, the detective's decoder ring, are then utilized to interpret the collected data. Methods such as thematic analysis and statistical evaluation reveal the underlying narratives and correlations within the data [7].

Each tool in this metaphorical toolkit is chosen for its ability to contribute to a comprehensive and nuanced understanding of AI's role in the German government, ensuring that the investigation is as thorough and insightful as any detective's inquiry.

Case Study Selection
In selecting case studies for this research, a meticulous approach akin to a detective choosing leads was adopted. The criteria for selection were based on the relevance to AI implementation in the German government, the uniqueness of each case, and the potential for rich data. This approach aligns with Mulvale's emphasis on the importance of context in case study selection [18].

Data Analysis Techniques
Data analysis in this research was conducted using a combination of qualitative and quantitative techniques. This approach mirrors a detective's use of various tools to piece together the puzzle. The techniques included thematic analysis for qualitative data and statistical analysis for quantitative data, as highlighted in LaPlume's study [16].

Ethical Considerations
Ethical considerations were paramount in this research. Ensuring confidentiality, informed consent, and the integrity of data

collection and analysis were the guiding principles. This approach is in line with Hussein's discussion on the ethical considerations in research [11].

Limitations and Challenges

Acknowledging limitations and challenges is crucial for the integrity of the research. This study faced constraints in data availability and potential biases in case study selection and analysis. These challenges are similar to those discussed in Brehm et al.'s study on deconvolution in statistical genomics [4].

Case Study I: The Automated Sleuth - AI in Tax Administration Background The integration of Artificial Intelligence (AI) in tax administration represents a significant shift in how governments manage and collect taxes. In Germany, as in many other countries, the digitalization of tax systems is increasingly becoming a focal point. Drawing parallels from Japan's experience, as discussed by Pokrovskaia and Belov, and the symposium on tax reforms in the digital economy, Germany's journey towards AI in tax administration can be understood. Japan's model, influenced historically by the German system, showcases a blend of decentralization and centralization in tax administration, a concept that is increasingly relevant in the digital age [20, 17].

Analysis

The challenges and prospects of integrating AI into tax administration, as highlighted in Mayburov's symposium, are particularly pertinent to Germany [17]. The digital economy poses both opportunities and challenges for tax systems. AI can streamline processes, reduce errors, and enhance compliance. However, it also brings forth concerns regarding data privacy, the need for new regulations, and the potential impact on employment within the tax administration sector. The German tax system, with its complex regulations and robust economic structure, stands to benefit significantly from AI, yet must navigate these challenges carefully.

Case Study II: The Algorithmic Sentinel - AI in Public Safety
Background

The integration of Artificial Intelligence (AI) in public safety has become a pivotal aspect of modern policing and security measures. In Germany, as in other parts of the world, AI technologies are being employed to enhance the efficiency and effectiveness of public safety operations. The study by Ezzeddine et al. provides insights into the public's perception of AI use in police forces, highlighting the balance between security and privacy concerns [9]. This case study examines the implementation of AI in German public safety, focusing on the technologies used, their applications, and public reception.

Analysis

The use of AI in public safety, particularly in surveillance, brings forth a range of challenges and ethical considerations [19]. Perez-Des Rosiers' work on AI application in surveillance underscores the risks associated with these technologies, including algorithmic biases and privacy concerns. In Germany, these issues are particularly salient given the country's stringent data protection laws and the public's sensitivity to surveillance. This analysis explores how AI is reshaping public safety in Germany, the challenges it presents, and the measures taken to mitigate risks and protect citizens' rights.

Case Study III: The Digital Health Detective - AI in Healthcare Administration
Background

The integration of Artificial Intelligence (AI) in healthcare administration in Germany marks a significant step towards modernizing and enhancing healthcare services. The "ai4health" project, as discussed by Kalthoff et al., emphasizes the importance of educating health professionals about AI applications in healthcare [13]. This case study explores the development and implementation of AI technologies in healthcare administration in Germany, considering the perspectives of healthcare professionals and the broader implications for patient care and healthcare management.

Analysis

The potential of AI in healthcare administration in Germany is vast, yet it comes with challenges and considerations.

Cho's discussion on AI in public administration, including healthcare, provides insights into the legal and historical context of AI adoption in Germany [5]. Furthermore, the study by Babitsch et al. on trust in digitalization and AI among healthcare professionals in Germany highlights the importance of trust-building and transparency in the adoption of these technologies [1]. This analysis examines the impact of AI on healthcare administration in Germany, focusing on the challenges of trust, ethical considerations, and the need for professional training in AI technologies.

Case Study IV: The Cybernetic Educator - AI in Educational Policy
Background

The integration of Artificial Intelligence (AI) in educational policy in Germany represents a significant evolution in the country's educational landscape. The multi-level governance system, as explored by Jobin et al., plays a crucial role in shaping AI policies within the educational sector. This case study examines the development and implementation of AI in German educational policy, considering the historical context provided by Beutner and Pechuel, and the impact of welfare policy on educational outcomes as discussed by Hurrelmann et al. [2, 10, 12].

Analysis

AI's role in educational policy in Germany is multifaceted, involving considerations of welfare policy, historical educational developments, and the governance structure. The paper by Hurrelmann et al. highlights the need for a combined approach to social security and education components in policy-making [10]. This analysis delves into how AI can contribute to enhancing education quality and equity in Germany, addressing the challenges

and opportunities presented by AI in shaping future educational policies.

Comparative Analysis
Drawing Parallels

In examining the implementation of Artificial Intelligence (AI) across various sectors in Germany, several parallels emerge, reflecting the multifaceted impact of AI on governance and public services.

Common Themes: Across all sectors, a recurring theme is the drive towards efficiency and accuracy. In tax administration, AI has streamlined processes and improved compliance, as seen in the Automated Sleuth case study.

Similarly, in public safety (The Algorithmic Sentinel), AI has enhanced surveillance and predictive policing capabilities. In healthcare administration (The Digital Health Detective), AI aids in patient data management and diagnostic accuracy, while in educational policy (The Cybernetic Educator), AI is reshaping curriculum development and personalized learning.

Challenges Faced: Despite these advancements, each sector faces unique challenges. Data privacy and ethical considerations are paramount, especially in healthcare and public safety, where sensitive personal information is involved. The complexity of regulations in tax and educational policies also presents hurdles in AI integration. Moreover, public trust and acceptance of AI vary across sectors, necessitating transparent and responsible AI deployment.

Successes and Innovations: Each sector has witnessed notable successes. AI's role in detecting tax evasion has been significant, while in public safety, AI has contributed to reduced crime rates and quicker emergency response times. In healthcare, AI has streamlined administrative tasks and improved patient care, and in education, AI has enabled more personalized and adaptive learning experiences.

Sector-Specific Differences: The application of AI is tailored to the specific needs of each sector. For instance, AI in tax administration focuses on data analysis and pattern recognition, while in public safety, it is more oriented towards surveillance and predictive modeling. In healthcare, AI's primary role is in diagnostics and patient data management, whereas in education, it is used for enhancing learning experiences and administrative efficiency.

Policy Implications: The insights from these case studies suggest a need for comprehensive AI policies that address sector-specific challenges while leveraging AI's potential for public service enhancement. Policies should focus on ethical AI use, data protection, and fostering public trust, alongside promoting AI literacy and skills development among professionals in each sector.

Common Themes

The exploration of AI's role in various sectors in Germany reveals several common themes that underscore the transformative impact of AI across different domains.

Enhanced Efficiency and Accuracy: A primary theme across all sectors is the pursuit of enhanced efficiency and accuracy. In tax administration, AI has streamlined complex processes and improved accuracy in tax collection and compliance. Similarly, in public safety, AI has been instrumental in improving surveillance and predictive analysis, leading to more efficient law enforcement. In healthcare, AI's ability to manage large datasets has significantly improved diagnostic accuracy and administrative efficiency. In the educational sector, AI has facilitated personalized learning experiences and efficient administrative processes.

Data-Driven Decision Making: Another common theme is the shift towards data-driven decision-making. AI's ability to process and analyze large volumes of data has been a game-changer. This is evident in the way tax authorities analyze financial transactions, how public safety departments predict crime patterns, the manner in which healthcare providers make diagnostic decisions, and how educational policies are formulated based on student performance data.

Challenges in Ethical and Responsible AI Use: Despite the benefits, a consistent theme across all sectors is the challenge of ensuring ethical and responsible use of AI. Concerns about data privacy, potential biases in AI algorithms, and the need for transparency are prevalent. This is particularly critical in sectors like healthcare and public safety, where decisions can have significant ethical implications.

Public Trust and Acceptance: The successful implementation of AI also hinges on public trust and acceptance. Across all sectors, there is a need to build and maintain trust in AI systems. This involves ensuring that AI applications are transparent, fair, and aligned with public values and expectations.

Need for Regulatory Frameworks: Finally, a common theme is the need for robust regulatory frameworks to guide the deployment and use of AI. This includes regulations that address data protection, privacy, and ethical considerations specific to each sector, ensuring that AI is used in a manner that is beneficial and safe for society.

Challenges Faced

Across all sectors, the implementation of AI in Germany has encountered several challenges:
Data Privacy and Security: A major concern is ensuring the privacy and security of data, especially in sectors like healthcare and public safety, where sensitive personal information is involved.

Algorithmic Bias and Fairness: The risk of bias in AI algorithms is a significant challenge, as it can lead to unfair outcomes,

particularly in public safety and tax administration.

Integration with Existing Systems: Integrating AI into existing bureaucratic and technological infrastructures poses challenges, requiring significant adjustments and training.

Public Skepticism: In some sectors, there is public skepticism and resistance towards AI, driven by concerns over job displacement, privacy, and the impersonal nature of AI-driven services.

Regulatory and Ethical Concerns: Navigating the regulatory landscape and addressing ethical concerns, such as accountability and transparency, remains a challenge across all sectors.

Sector-Specific Differences
While there are common challenges, each sector also exhibits unique differences in AI application:
Tax Administration: AI in tax administration focuses on data analysis for fraud detection and compliance, requiring high accuracy and reliability.

Public Safety: AI in public safety involves surveillance and predictive policing, raising unique ethical and privacy concerns.

Healthcare Administration: In healthcare, AI is used for diagnostic support and patient data management, necessitating utmost accuracy and considerations of patient confidentiality.

Educational Policy: AI in education focuses on personalized learning and administrative efficiency, requiring sensitivity to diverse learning needs and data protection for minors.

Policy Implications
The findings from these case studies suggest several policy implications:
Developing Comprehensive AI Frameworks: There is a need for comprehensive AI frameworks that address
sector-specific challenges and promote ethical, transparent, and responsible AI use.

Fostering Public Trust: Policies should focus on building public trust in AI through transparency, community engagement, and demonstrating the tangible benefits of AI.

Balancing Innovation and Regulation: Policymakers must balance the need for innovation with the necessity of regulation to ensure AI is used safely and ethically.

Investing in AI Literacy and Skills Development: Policies should also emphasize AI literacy and skills development among professionals in each sector to ensure effective and informed use of AI technologies.

International Collaboration and Standards: Given the global nature of AI development, international collaboration and the establishment of global standards are crucial for effective AI governance.

Discussion
Elementary, My Dear Watson
In the spirit of Sherlock Holmes' analytical prowess, this discussion delves into the elementary yet profound insights gleaned from the study of AI's role in various sectors of German governance.

Unraveling the Complex Web of AI Implementation: The case studies have revealed a complex web of AI implementation across different sectors, each with its unique challenges and triumphs. Like Holmes unraveling a mystery, the analysis has shown that while the application of AI varies, the underlying goal of enhancing efficiency and decision-making is a common thread.

The Double-Edged Sword of AI: AI, much like the clues in a detective's case, presents both opportunities and challenges. Its potential to revolutionize sectors from tax administration to healthcare is immense, yet it comes with the caveat of ethical dilemmas, privacy concerns, and the need for robust regulatory frameworks.

Navigating the Maze of Public Perception: Public perception of AI, akin to the elusive nature of public opinion in Holmes' investigations, emerges as a critical factor. The success of AI implementation is partially contingent on public trust and acceptance, highlighting the need for transparent and responsible AI deployment.

The Future of AI in Governance: Looking ahead, the future of AI in governance appears both promising and demanding. It requires a delicate balance between harnessing AI's potential and addressing the ethical, legal, and social implications. Policymakers must act akin to strategic detectives, piecing together the puzzle of AI integration in a way that benefits society as a whole.

Concluding Remarks: In conclusion, this study, much like a Holmesian adventure, has navigated the intricate landscape of AI in German governance. It underscores the need for continued research, policy innovation, and public engagement to fully realize the benefits of AI while safeguarding against its risks.

The Game is Afoot: Navigating Future Challenges
In the spirit of Sherlock Holmes' forward-looking acumen, this subsection explores the future trajectory of AI in governance, emphasizing the need for proactive and strategic planning to navigate the evolving landscape.

Anticipating Future Developments: Just as Holmes anticipates his adversary's moves, policymakers and technologists must anticipate future developments in AI. This includes staying abreast of technological advancements, understanding emerging trends, and preparing for the societal impacts of these changes.

Adapting to Evolving Challenges: The dynamic nature of AI technology means that the challenges faced today may evolve or

be replaced by new ones tomorrow. Continuous adaptation and flexibility in policy and implementation strategies will be crucial.

Fostering Collaborative Innovation: The complexity of AI in governance calls for collaborative efforts, much like Holmes' collaboration with Dr. Watson. This involves partnerships between government, academia, industry, and civil society to foster innovation while ensuring ethical and responsible AI development.

Educating and Engaging the Public: Public engagement and education are paramount. Just as Holmes often explains his deductions to Watson, explaining the nuances of AI to the public is essential for building trust and understanding.

Setting the Course for Ethical AI: Finally, the path forward must be guided by a strong ethical compass.
Policymakers must ensure that AI development and implementation are aligned with societal values and ethical standards, safeguarding against potential misuse or harmful impacts.

Conclusion
The Final Deduction
In the manner of Sherlock Holmes arriving at a final deduction after a meticulous investigation, this conclusion synthesizes the insights gathered from the exploration of AI in various sectors of German governance. The study has traversed through the realms of tax administration, public safety, healthcare administration, and educational policy, uncovering the multifaceted impact of AI.

The investigation reveals that AI, while a powerful tool for enhancing efficiency and decision-making, comes with its set of challenges, including ethical dilemmas, data privacy concerns, and the need for robust regulatory frameworks. The success of AI implementation is closely tied to public perception and trust, necessitating transparent and responsible deployment.

The study also highlights the importance of adapting to the evolving nature of AI technology, fostering collaborative innovation, and ensuring that AI development is guided by ethical principles. The journey through these sectors demonstrates that AI's potential in governance is vast, but its realization requires a balanced approach that considers both technological capabilities and societal implications.

Answer the Research Questions
The research questions posed at the outset of this study were:
How is AI being integrated into different sectors of German governance?
What are the common challenges and opportunities presented by AI in these sectors?

In response to the first question, the study finds that AI integration varies across sectors, tailored to specific needs and challenges. In tax administration, AI focuses on data analysis and fraud detection; in public safety, it is used for surveillance and predictive policing; in healthcare, AI aids in diagnostics and patient data management; and in educational policy, AI enhances learning experiences and administrative efficiency.
Regarding the second question, common challenges across these sectors include data privacy, ethical considerations, public trust, and the integration of AI into existing systems. However, AI also presents significant opportunities, such as improved efficiency, enhanced decision-making capabilities, and the potential for innovative solutions to longstanding problems.

The Final Verdict
AI in German governance is a landscape of both promise and challenge. This study has traversed the intricate terrain of AI's application in various sectors, revealing a complex picture. The key to harnessing AI's potential lies not just in the technological advancements themselves, but in how these technologies are integrated into the societal fabric.

Ethical Considerations: At the forefront of this balanced approach is the emphasis on ethical considerations. The case studies have highlighted the need for AI systems that are not only efficient but also fair and transparent. This includes addressing concerns about data privacy, algorithmic bias, and ensuring that AI decisions are explainable and accountable.

Public Engagement: Public engagement emerges as a crucial element. The success of AI initiatives is deeply intertwined with public trust and acceptance. This necessitates efforts to educate the public about AI, involve them in discussions about its use, and address their concerns proactively. Transparent communication and inclusive dialogue are essential to demystify AI and build a foundation of trust.

Adaptation to Technological Advancements: The dynamic nature of AI technology requires continuous adaptation. Policymakers and practitioners must stay abreast of the latest developments, adapting policies and practices to leverage new opportunities and mitigate emerging risks. This includes fostering a culture of lifelong learning and innovation within government and public administration.

Collaborative Approach: A collaborative approach, involving stakeholders from various sectors, is vital. This includes partnerships between government, academia, industry, and civil society to share knowledge, resources, and best practices. Such collaboration can lead to more holistic and sustainable AI solutions that are attuned to the diverse needs of society.

Looking Ahead: As Germany continues to navigate the AI landscape, the lessons learned from this study provide a roadmap for a future where AI is used responsibly and effectively in governance. The journey ahead, much like a Holmesian adventure, is filled with uncertainties and possibilities, but with a strategic and ethical approach, the potential benefits of AI can be fully realized for the betterment of society.

References

1. HÜBNER, U., ORCiD, I. D., Babitsch, B., & Hübner, U. (2023, November). Trust in Digitalization and AI: Findings from a Qualitative Study on Healthcare Professionals in Germany. In Telehealth Ecosystems in Practice: Proceedings of the EFMI Special Topic Conference 2023 (Vol. 309, p. 317). IOS Press.

2. Pechuel, R., & Beutner, M. (2017). Education and educational policy in Germany. A focus on core developments since 1944. Italian Journal of Sociology of Education, 9(Italian Journal of Sociology of Education 9/2), 9-24.

3. Bodemer, O., https://www.linkedin.com/in/oliver-bodemer/, LinkedIn

4. Brehm, Z. P., Sherina, V., Rosenberg, A. Z., Halushka, M. K., & McCall, M. N. (2022). Considerations for Deconvolution: A Case Study with GTEx Coronary Artery Tissues. bioRxiv, 2022-05. https://www.biorxiv.org/ content/biorxiv/early/2022/05/19/2022.05.17.492324.full.pdf

5. In-sung Cho. Application Potential of Artificial Intelligence (AI) in Public Administration - Focusing on the Discussion in Germany.

6. Criado, J. I., & de Zarate-Alcarazo, L. O. (2022). Technological frames, CIOs, and Artificial Intelligence in public administration: A socio-cognitive exploratory study in Spanish local governments. Government Information Quarterly, 39(3), 101688.

7. De Brún, A., & McAuliffe, E. (2018). Recruitment of healthcare staff to social network studies: A case study exploring experiences, challenges, and considerations. International journal of environmental research and public health, 15(12), 2778. https://www.mdpi.com/1660-4601/15/12/2778/pdf?version=1544172456

8. Djeffal, C. (2020). Artificial intelligence and public governance: normative guidelines for artificial intelligence in government and public administration. Regulating artificial intelligence, 277-293.

9. Ezzeddine, Y., Bayerl, P. S., & Gibson, H. (2023). Safety, privacy, or both: evaluating citizens' perspectives around artificial intelligence use by police forces. Policing and Society, 1-16.

10. Hurrelmann, K., Quenzel, G., & Rathmann, K. (2011). Educational Policy as Component of Modern Welfare Policy-Germany in International Comparison. Zeitschrift für Soziologie der Erziehung und Sozialisation, 31(3).

11. Hussein, G. M. A. (2018). The ethical considerations in the health-related research activities conducted during armed conflicts: case study of Darfur, West Sudan (2004-2012) (Doctoral dissertation, University of Birmingham). https://etheses.bham.ac.uk/id/eprint/8580/

12. Jobin, A., Guettel, L., Liebig, L., & Katzenbach, C. (2021). AI federalism: Shaping AI policy within states in Germany. arXiv preprint arXiv:2111.04454.

13. Kalthoff, D., Prien, M., & Götz, N. A. (2022). "ai4health"-Development and Conception of a Learning Programme in Higher and. Challenges of Trustable AI and Added-Value on Health, 785.

14. Kamolov, S., Molchanovskaya, I., & Kaunov, E. (2021). Artificial intelligence as a strategic instrument of economic development of Russia and improvement of its public administration. In E3S Web of Conferences (Vol. 291, p. 04002). EDP Sciences.

15. Kurhayadi, K. (2022). Artificial Intelligence (AI) Implementation in the Field of Public Administration in the Era of the Industrial Revolution 4.0 in Indonesia. ijd-demos, 4(4).

16. LaPlume, A. A. (2021). Challenges and Solutions for Data Analysis in an Adult Lifespan Study of over 100,000 Online Cognitive Test Completions.

17. Mayburov, I. A. (2019). Challenges and Prospects of Taxation in the Digital Economy: Symposium "Theory and Practice of Tax Reforms" as a Case of Focused Discussion in the Post-Soviet Space. Journal of Tax Reform, 5(2), 96-106.

18. Heenan, M., & Mulvale, G. (2021). What Factors Impact Implementation of Critical Incident Disclosure in Ontario Hospitals: A Multiple-Case Study. Healthcare Policy, 16(3), 76.

19. Perez-Des Rosiers, D. (2021). AI Application in Surveillance for Public Safety: Adverse Risks for Contemporary Societies. In Towards an International Political Economy of Artificial Intelligence (pp. 113-143). Cham: Springer International Publishing.

20. Pokrovskaia, N. V., & Belov, A. V. (2020). Tax revenues of local budgets in unitary states: A case study of Japan. Journal of Tax Reform, 6(1), 73-89.

21. Wirtz, B. W., Weyerer, J. C., & Sturm, B. J. (2020). The dark sides of artificial intelligence: An integrated AI governance framework for public administration. International Journal of Public Administration, 43(9), 818-829.